Clinic Perceptions of Role-Playing as a Therapy Technique

Alicia Purvis
MA Thesis
April 25, 2008

Thesis Committee
Committee Chair:
Rosemary Lubinski, Ed.D.

Committee Members:
Carol Sellers, M.A.
Geralyn Timler, Ph.D.

Presentation Goals

• Review current literature on role-playing in general and in speech-language pathology

• Compare perceptions of professional speech-language pathologists and graduate students regarding role playing

• Discuss implications for teaching and training

Focus of Speech-Language Therapy

• Seek functional outcomes

• Provide therapy in time efficient manner

• Improve quality of life

What is role-playing?

• Technique using simulated communication scenarios to elicit specific or spontaneous responses

• 3 Categories: fully scripted, partially scripted, unscripted (Nestel & Tierney, 2007)

• Used to change behaviors and improve communication skills
  □ in psychology (Lindsay et al, 2004), education (McCarthy & Anderson, 2000), medical training (Manning & Kripalani, 2007), and speech-language pathology.

Role-Playing for Fluency

• To desensitize clients to stressful communication situations (Guitar, 2006)

• Used to teach dysfluent children appropriate responses to bullying (Murphy, Varass, & Quesal, 2007) and for peer intervention (Turnbull, 2006)

• Not successful for changing the dysfluent child’s feelings about stuttering (Scavo, 2007)
Role-Playing for Adult Language Disorders

- **Gains...**
  - in functional communication (Herbert et al, 2003)
  - on specific tasks for individuals with aphasia (Hinckley, Patterson, Carr, 2001)
  - in generalization and maintenance of workplace conversation skills for patients following TBI (O’Reilly, Lancione, & Kane, 2000)

Role-Playing for Child Language Disorders

- **Sociodramatic play (scripted play)** reinforces thematic play skills seen in typically developing preschoolers (Goldstein et al, 2007)

- Children receiving social skills training (including role-playing) showed greater improvement in pragmatic skills than control (Godfrey et al, 2005)

- Fewer gains seen if social skills (pragmatic) deficit occurs with other language deficits (Godfrey et al, 2005)

Why Study Role-Playing in SLP?

- Shown to be strong teaching tool in other disciplines

- Literature suggests role-playing is an appropriate therapy technique in some contexts

- Unclear if, when, or how clinicians are using role-playing in therapy

- Or if graduate students are being trained in its use

Research Questions

How do professional speech-language pathologists and graduate students differ in their perceptions of:

1. Why clinicians use role-playing in speech-language therapy?
2. The effectiveness of role-playing as a therapy tool?
3. The nature of role-playing activities in speech-language pathology?
4. Which patient populations are targeted for role-playing therapy?
5. What barriers hinder the use of role-playing?

Survey and Cover Letter

Sent to...

- **Professionals**
  - 430/1000 randomly chosen names from ASHA mailing list for NYS

- **Students**
  - Via professor at 10 CDS Programs in NY State listed on ASHA Website

Respondents

**Professionals** (N=110)

- 26% response rate
- 97% MA Degree
- 86% 4+ years experience
- 78% NYS License, TSSLD, & ASHA

**Students** (N=145)

- 8/10 Universities responded
- 97% BA Degree
- 100% 1+ semesters experience
- 83% No license/certification
Respondent Work Settings

### Professionals

- **Work Setting (N=109):**
  - Education (N=78): 72%
  - Private Practice: 34%

- **Population Age (N=109):**
  - K-12 (N=69): 63%
  - Pre-K: 54%
  - EI: 52%

- **Population Disorders (N=109):**
  - Language (N=101): 93%
  - Articulation/Motor (N=100): 92%
  - Pragmatics: 77%
  - CAP: 57%
  - Fluency: 50%

### Students

- **Work Setting (N=113):**
  - Education (N=64): 54%
  - Other: 39%

- **Population Age (N=131):**
  - K-12 (N=94): 72%
  - Pre-K: 41%
  - Adult: 41%

- **Population Disorders (N=133):**
  - Language (N=111): 84%
  - Articulation/Motor: 73%
  - Pragmatics: 54%
  - Fluency: 29%
  - CAP: 27%

### Data Analysis

- Frequencies
- Chi-square

### Results: How frequently is role-playing used? (%)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Professionals</th>
<th>Students</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Home</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>36%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reality</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Occupation</td>
<td>19%</td>
<td>46%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frequency</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daily</td>
<td>43%</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Results: Why use role-playing?

- **Top Three Reasons to Use Role-Playing**
  - **#1: Application of Functional Skills**
    - Professionals: 48%
    - Students: 52%
  - **#2: Increasing Generalization**
    - Professionals: 37%
    - Students: 39%
  - **#3: Allows client to self-monitor**
    - Professionals: 26%
    - Students: 36%

### Results: How effective is role-playing?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Professionals</th>
<th>Students</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Generalization</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professionals (N = 82)</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students (N=74)</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Application of functional skills</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professionals (N=86)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students (N=79)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Allows self-monitoring</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professionals (N=63)</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students (N=60)</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Results: What is the nature of role-playing used?

- 91 Professionals reported...
- 87 Students reported...

- Clients, clinicians, or family members select role-playing topics (53%)
- Use role-playing to target social context (93%)
- Role-playing sessions are 1:1 or with small group of clients (39%)

- Clients, clinicians, or family members select role-playing topics (56%)
- Use role-playing to target social context (83%)
- Role-playing sessions are 1:1 (53%)

Results: What populations are targeted for role-playing?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Professionals</th>
<th>Students</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Target Age (N=92):</strong></td>
<td><strong>Target Age (N=86):</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Primary, 5-11 (N = 64)</td>
<td>Primary, 5-11 (N = 61)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>70%</td>
<td>71%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secondary</td>
<td>Adult</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pre-K</td>
<td>Secondary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Target Disorders (N=90):</strong></th>
<th><strong>Target Disorders (N=87):</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pragmatics (N = 64)</td>
<td>Pragmatics (N=74)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>93%</td>
<td>85%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Language</td>
<td>Fluency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>84</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fluency</td>
<td>Language</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>63</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Results: What hinders role-playing?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Professional Top Three Barriers to Role-Playing</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>#1: Clients don’t understand role-playing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#2: Poor group dynamic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#3: Difficult to measure</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Student Top Three Barriers to Role-Playing</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>#1: Difficult to measure</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#2: Clients don’t understand role-playing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>#3: Other (i.e. didn’t know about it, supervisor restraints)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Discussion

- Grads and professionals who use role-playing generally share similar views on...
  - Reasons for using the technique
  - Its effectiveness
  - And the nature of implementation
    - Who’s involved, topic selection, goals, populations targeted
  - Still significant difference in the frequency of role-playing ($X^2 = 41.3, \ p < .001$)
    - Barriers to role-playing
    - Method for learning about role-playing

Discussion

- Professionals
  - Are using role-playing in treatment of a variety of disorders and age groups
  - Report that it is mostly to very effective

- Students
  - Many not using role-playing
  - Many not exposed to role-playing

Training Implications

- Develop skills at the graduate level
  - What is the best way to train graduate students in role-playing?

- Make role-playing easier to measure
Take Home Message

- Graduate clinicians should be familiar with role-playing in speech-language therapy given its application in various forms and settings by professional speech-language pathologists.

References


Questions?

References


